

---

Thursday, June 10, 2004.

*10 o'clock a.m.*

Prayers

Mr. Foran laid upon the table of the House a petition signed by citizens of the Miramichi calling upon Mr. Malley, the Member for Miramichi-Bay du Vin, to vote against any plan to reduce beds and or service at their regional hospital. (Petition 42)

---

Following Oral Questions, Mr. Speaker requested that the Member for Caraquet withdraw the terms “stupid,” “unprofessional,” and “arrogant” in reference to the Minister of Health and Wellness. The Member withdrew the comments.

---

Hon. P. Robichaud rose on a Point of Order and requested that the Member for Charlotte withdraw the term “crook.” Mr. Speaker advised the House that he would take the matter under advisement and address the matter following routine proceedings.

---

Mr. Boudreau gave Notice of Motion 110 that on Thursday, June 17, 2004, he would move the following resolution, seconded by Ms. Robichaud:

That an address be presented to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor praying that he cause to be laid upon the table of the House all correspondence, including minutes of meetings, letters, e-mails, memoranda, briefing notes, hand-written notes, reports, analysis and research between November 2002 and June 9, 2004 pertaining to decisions, recommendations and advice made by District Education Council (DEC) #17.

---

Mr. Boudreau gave Notice of Motion 111 that on Thursday, June 17, 2004, he would move the following resolution, seconded by Ms. Robichaud:

That an address be presented to His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor praying that he cause to be laid upon the table of the House fall correspondence, including minutes of meetings, letters, e-mails, memoranda, briefing notes, hand-written notes, reports, analysis and research between November 2002 and June 9, 2004 pertaining to advice received and decisions made by the Minister of Education pertaining to (DEC) # 17.

---

Hon. P. Robichaud announced that it was the intention of government that following second reading of Bills and with the unanimous consent of the House to dispense with the two hours reserved for Private Members' Motions, the House would resolve itself into a Committee of the Whole House to consider legislation, namely: Bills 16, 36, 21, 23, and 33. Subsequently, the House would resolve itself into a Committee of Supply to consider the estimates of the Department of Health and Wellness.

---

It was agreed by unanimous consent to dispense with Private Members' Motions, and to vary the hours of sitting to recess at 12 noon and to resume at 1 o'clock p.m.

---

At 11.19 o'clock a.m., Mr. Speaker declared a recess and left the chair.

*11.32 o'clock p.m.*

Mr. Speaker resumed the chair and delivered the following ruling:

STATEMENT BY SPEAKER

Yesterday, subsequent to a point of order raised by the member for Fredericton-Fort Nashwaak, I undertook to review the transcript of question period and to get back to the House, if necessary. Speaking to the point of order, the member for Fredericton-Fort Nashwaak claimed that the Minister of Education had used unparliamentary language in responding to a question from the member for Bathurst, by stating "continuer à dire des faussetés". The member referred to *Beauchesne's Parliamentary Rules and Forms*, sixth edition, as the basis of the claim that the word "fausseté", which means "falsehood" in English, was unparliamentary.

While there are some clearly established words and certain kinds of language that are considered offensive or unparliamentary, it is left to the Chair's discretion to interpret or to qualify the words spoken by the member, according to the circumstances or context in which the words are used. I will quote from paragraph 486 of *Beauchesne's*, sixth edition, page 123.

**§486.** (1) *It is impossible to lay down any specific rules in regard to injurious reflections uttered in debate against particular Members, or to declare beforehand what expressions are or are not contrary to order; much depends upon the tone and manner, and intention, of the person speaking . . .*

I have reviewed the transcript of question period for both June 8 and June 9, involving exchanges between the Minister of Education and the member for Bathurst. It appears to the chair that the word “fausseté” was not used against a member in the Chamber, but was used to describe, in a generic way, statements that have been made by the opposition during debates in the House. However, it could be construed that the remark was directed against the member who was asking the question.

In a follow-up question during yesterday’s question period, the member for Bathurst referred to a famous quote of Sir Winston Churchill which one might infer was directed against the Minister of Education. I find the comments of both honourable members to border on the unparliamentary. Members should, in future, refrain from making comments that could be construed as questioning the truthfulness of statements made in the House by fellow members. I urge members to keep this in mind and recognize that they have a duty in the preservation of order. In fact, they have a duty to help the chair in ensuring that free debate can take place in this Chamber while preserving the basic dignity traditionally applied to the use of language in parliamentary institutions.

---

Mr. Speaker ruled on the Point of Order raised earlier in the sitting finding that the words used by the Member for Charlotte, Mr. Doucet, “they sneak around like a bunch of crooks” to be unparliamentary and asked the Member to withdraw the unparliamentary words.

The Member for Charlotte withdrew the term “crooks.”

---

The following Private Bills were read a second time:

Bill 48, *An Act to Incorporate Firecrest Hambro Trust Corporation Canada Limited.*

Bill 54, *An Act Respecting the New Brunswick Society of Cardiology Technologists.*

Pursuant to Standing Rule 121, Mr. Speaker ordered Private Bill 48 and 54 for third reading forthwith.

---

The following Private Bills were read a third time:

Bill 48, *An Act to Incorporate Firecrest Hambro Trust Corporation Canada Limited.*

Bill 54, *An Act Respecting the New Brunswick Society of Cardiology Technologists.*

Ordered that the said Bills do pass.

---

The House resolved itself into a Committee of the Whole with Mr. Holder in the chair.

At 12 noon the Chairman left the chair to resume again at 1 o'clock p.m.

*1 o'clock p.m.*

The Committee resumed with Mr. Holder in the chair.

And after some time, Mr. Speaker resumed the chair and Mr. Holder, the Chairman, after requesting that Mr. Speaker revert to the Order of Presentations of Committee Reports, reported:

That the Committee had directed him to report the following Bills as agreed to:

Bill 21, *An Act to Amend the Family Services Act.*

Bill 23, *An Act to Amend the Executive Council Act.*

Bill 36, *An Act to Repeal the Bulk Sales Act.*

And that he had been directed to report the following Bill agreed to as amended:

Bill 16, *An Act to Amend the Provincial Court Act.*

And the Committee asked leave to make a further report.

Pursuant to Standing Rule 78.1, Mr. Speaker put the question on the motion deemed to be before the House, that the report be concurred in, and it was resolved in the affirmative.

---

The House, according to Order, resolved itself into a Committee of Supply with Mr. Holder in the chair.

And after some time, Mr. C. LeBlanc took the chair.

During the deliberations, Mr. MacIntyre welcome to the House Mr. Norman McFarlane, PC Member for Saint John Lancaster (1999-2003) and Minister of Training and Employment Development. Hon. Ms. Blaney joined with the Member in this regard.

And after some time, Mr. Holder resumed the chair.

And after some further time, Mr. Malley took the chair as Acting Chairman.

And after some time, Mr. C. LeBlanc resumed the chair.

And after some further time, Mr. Betts took the chair as Acting Chairman.

And after some further time spent in Committee of Supply, Mr. Holder took the chair.

And after some further time, Mr. Speaker resumed the chair, and Mr. Holder, the Chairman, after requesting that Mr. Speaker revert to Presentations of Committee Reports, reported that the Committee had had under consideration the matters referred to them, had made some progress therein, and asked leave to sit again.

Pursuant to Standing Rule 78.1, Mr. Speaker then put the question on the motion deemed to be before the House, that the report be concurred in, and it was resolved in the affirmative.

---

And then 6 o'clock p.m. the House adjourned.

---

The following documents, having been deposited with the Clerk of the House were deemed laid upon the table of the House pursuant to Standing Rule 39:

Documents requested in Notice of Motion 99	June 4, 2003
Documents requested in Notice of Motion 91	June 8, 2003
Documents requested in Notice of Motion 102	June 9, 2003
Documents requested in Notice of Motion 93	June 10, 2003